

## **Mains Practice Question**

Recently, Municipal officials with the help of police razed down several temporary shelter homes in a slum area, claiming that they had encroached upon the land in the city where a beautification project has been planned. The residents of this slum are traditional bamboo artisans who were resettled here five years ago after being displaced from another site.

Eviction from a slum during the lockdown rendered people homeless. The families claimed that the lockdown affected the wedding season during which they used to earn a bare minimum amount for their subsistence to earn a bare minimum amount for their subsistence by selling bamboo items and utensils. Now they are left with no other means of livelihood and are homeless after losing their shelter. means of livelihood and homeless after losing their shelter.

Meanwhile some displaced residents started working as ragpickers, but now due to lockdown the scrap warehouses have been shut. Due to which the savings of the affected people is drained and they are on the verge of being famished.

You are the Divisional Commissioner of that area and it is your responsibility to resolve all the issues including the rehabilitation of the displaced people in implementation of the beautification project.

- a. Identify the stakeholders and the ethical issues involved in the case.
- b. What are the options available to you? Which one do you think will be the most appropriate step that can be taken. Justify.

10 Jul, 2020 GS Paper 4 Case Studies

## **Body**

| Stakeholders Involved    | Ethical issues   |
|--------------------------|--|
| State Government and     | <ul> <li>Uphold the constitutional values of equality and inclusivity in</li> </ul>        |
| District Administration. | development.   |
|                          | <ul><li>Maintaining rationality in policy.</li></ul>                                       |
| Divisional Commissioner  | <ul> <li>Adopt beneficence and justice in dealing with public issues.</li> </ul>           |
|                          | <ul><li>Show empathy towards the displaced families.</li></ul>                             |
|                          | <ul><li>Maintaining impartiality in rehabilitation work.</li></ul>                         |
|                          | <ul><li>Be transparent in conduct.</li></ul>   |
|                          | <ul><li>Maintain fairness in decision making.</li></ul>                                    |
|                          | <ul><li>Show honesty in carrying out the development work</li></ul>                        |
| Police                   | <ul> <li>To be sensitive and empathetic while carrying out demolition<br/>work.</li> </ul> |
|                          | <ul><li>To maintain legality of their actions.</li></ul>                                   |
|                          | <ul><li>Maintaining integrity in delivering duty.</li></ul>                                |
|                          | <ul><li>Be accountable for its omissions and commissions</li></ul>                         |
| Displaced People         | <ul><li>Uphold moral righteousness by being law abiding citizens.</li></ul>                |
|                          | <ul><li>Maintain social distance as a duty.</li></ul>                                      |
|                          | <ul><li>To maintain patience and tolerance in putting their demands.</li></ul>             |

|    | Short Term Course Of Action       |                                |  |  |  |  |
|----|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
|    | Course Of Action                  | Merits                         | Demerits                               |  |  |  |
| 1. | Stop the beautification work and  | It will provide relief to the  | Stopping the construction works        |  |  |  |
|    | keep the slums untouched.         | people.                        | will be detrimental to overall         |  |  |  |
|    |                                   |                                | development of the town.               |  |  |  |
| 2. | Leave the displaced workers on    | The district development work  | , ,                                    |  |  |  |
|    | their own as they had illegally   | will go on smoothly.           | is the liability of a welfare state to |  |  |  |
|    | encroached the government         |                                | facilitate the right to life to every  |  |  |  |
|    | land.                             |                                | individual.                            |  |  |  |
| 3. | Provide immediate relief to the   | This shall save them from      | In shortage of resources due to        |  |  |  |
|    | marooning people by facilitating  | hunger and starvation and      | the ongoing Covid-19 crisis,           |  |  |  |
|    | food supplies and other           | provide them immediate         | developing a good machinery to         |  |  |  |
|    | amenities under appropriate       | relief.                        | deliver these services in short        |  |  |  |
|    | schemes.                          |                                | notice would be challenging.           |  |  |  |
| 4. | Provide for the accomodation to   | It shall save them from        | There would be other such cases        |  |  |  |
|    | shelter for the unsettled people. | exigencies especially amidst a | in which people would be awaiting      |  |  |  |
|    |                                   | pandemic crisis.               | relief, their demands would have       |  |  |  |
|    |                                   |                                | to be heeded too.                      |  |  |  |
|    |                                   | It shall repose the faith of   | 6                                      |  |  |  |
|    |                                   | people in administration.      | Challenge of finding a place for       |  |  |  |
|    |                                   |                                | relocation with similar socio-         |  |  |  |
| _  |                                   |                                | economic and cultural space.           |  |  |  |
| 5. | Make arrangements for the         | Make them self dependent       | With a slowdown in the economy         |  |  |  |
|    | livelihood of the estranged       | and lessen their dependence    | due to pandemic, it would be           |  |  |  |
|    | people from slum destruction.     | on the state for their.        | challenging to arrange for their       |  |  |  |
|    |                                   |                                | employment immediately.                |  |  |  |

- The first two courses of actions would not be taken by me because the former is professionally inappropriate and latter is morally unsound.
- With the third, fourth and fifth course of action, I would be able to provide the much needed relief
  to the displaced people and initiate their rehabilitation process.
- If there are resource constraints with the district administration, to undertake these courses of action, I will take help from private welfare institutions like charitable shelter homes and NGOs.
- For complete rehabilitation of the unsettled people in this case and similar other cases in my area of jurisdiction, the following course of action will be taken:

|   | Long Term Course of Action   |   |  |  |  |
|---|--|---|--|--|--|
|   | Course of Action   | Merits  |  |  |  |
| 1 | Request the concerned ministries to provide an affordable housing plan for such displaced populations. | <ul> <li>It shall decrease encroachment on government<br/>land.</li> </ul>  |  |  |  |
| 2 | To initiate plans to check out sprawling in the towns.   | <ul> <li>This would check further development of slums.</li> <li>The district administration would be better prepared to deal with such cases in future.</li> </ul>   |  |  |  |
| 3 | Promote their bamboo art and provide access to the artists to better markets.                          | <ul> <li>Their product would get a price for their real value.</li> <li>It will make their livelihood sustainable.</li> <li>It shall conserve and provide impetus to indigenous bamboo products.</li> </ul> |  |  |  |
|   | Provide adequate support to restart the employment providing MSMEs like scrap industries.              | <ul> <li>It shall provide much needed employment and<br/>means of livelihood opportunities to the<br/>marginalised section in the urban areas.</li> </ul>   |  |  |  |

## Conclusion

Thus, the above plan would help me as a divisional magistrate to take decisions which are morally sound

and rationally appropriate to rehabilitate the displaced people at the earliest and bring maximum justice to most of the stakeholder.

PDF Refernece URL: https://www.drishtiias.com/mains-practice-question/question-685/pnt

