

# **Hunger Strikes as a Tool of Protest**

For Prelims: Right to Protest, Right to Life, Right to Freedom of Speech, IPC, BNS

For Mains: Hunger as a medium of Strike, Ethical dilemma related to hunger strike.

#### **Source: TH**

# Why in News?

<u>Hunger strikes</u> have always **raised a series of complicated moral questions**, such as whether it is appropriate to provide medicine against the will of a person on strike or if force-feeding could be a dangerous protocol.

# What are Hunger Strikes?

#### About:

- Hunger strikes are a form of protest involving the voluntary deprivation of food, sometimes also water.
- They are used to inspire, dissuade, or pressure others by highlighting injustices or demanding change.
- This form of protest can be seen as a **last resort** when other means of protest are unavailable or ineffective.

# Historical Context of Hunger Strikes:

- Ancient Practices:
  - The rules in pre-Christian Ireland provided for a troscad (fast) aimed at protesting against an unpayable debt, the object being to bring shame to the creditor.
  - Kalhana's Rajatarangini (account of royal dynasties of ancient Kashmir) has also several mentions of hunger strikes against undesirable royal edicts or taxes.
- Modern Development:
  - Russian Political Prisoners (1870s): Used hunger strikes to protest prison conditions.
  - Irish Republicans (1917-1920): Notable figures like Thomas Ashe and Terence MacSwiney died during hunger strikes, drawing attention to the Irish independence movement.
  - Indian Freedom Fighters:
    - Mahatma Gandhi: He described fasts as "a great weapon in the armoury of Satyagraha" and undertook this form of protest at least 20 times during the Independence movement.
    - Jatin Das (1929): Died after a 63-day hunger strike, highlighting the inhumane treatment of political prisoners.
    - **Bhagat Singh and Batukeshwar Dutt:** Protested poor prison conditions, drawing widespread support and media attention.

### Modern Context of Hunger Strikes in Independent India:

- Potti Sriramulu (1952): His hunger strike led to the formation of the state of Andhra Pradesh.
- Irom Sharmila (2000-2016): Protested against the Armed Forces Special Powers Act (AFSPA) in Manipur, highlighting human rights issues.
  - Continued her hunger strike for 16 years while being force-fed.
- Anna Hazare: He started a hunger strike in 2011 to exert pressure on the Indian government to enact a stringent anti-corruption law.

#### Recent Examples:

- Activist Manoj Jarange-Patil's fasts demanding reservations for the Maratha community.
- Sonam Wangchuk's 21-day hunger strike for Constitutional safeguards for Ladakh.
- Palestinian prisoner Khader Adnan's death after an 87-day hunger strike in 2023.

# What are the Arguments in Favour of Hunger Strike?

# Personal Autonomy and Freedom of Choice:

- Autonomy: Hunger strikes are seen as an expression of personal autonomy and selfdetermination. Individuals have the right to make decisions about their own bodies and to protest in a way that they see fit.
- Freedom of Expression: Hunger strikes are a <u>form of free speech</u> and a way for individuals to **voice their dissent** in a peaceful manner. This aligns with democratic values and the <u>right to protest</u>.

#### Non-violent Resistance:

- Non-violence: Hunger strikes are a form of non-violent protest, which can be ethically preferable to violent resistance. This approach can draw attention to injustices without causing harm to others.
- Moral High Ground: By choosing to suffer personally rather than inflicting suffering on others, hunger strikers can claim the moral high ground. Their willingness to endure personal hardship can highlight the perceived injustice they are protesting against.

### Drawing Attention to Injustices:

- Awareness: Hunger strikes can effectively draw public and media attention to issues that may otherwise be ignored. This can lead to increased awareness and pressure on authorities to address the grievances being protested.
- Symbolic Power: The act of a hunger strike carries powerful symbolism. It
  demonstrates the depth of the protester's conviction and the seriousness of the issue,
  potentially galvanising public opinion and support.

# Historical and Cultural Significance:

- Historical Precedent: Hunger strikes have been used effectively in various historical contexts, such as the suffragette movement, the Indian independence movement led by Mahatma Gandhi, and more recent political prisoners. This historical context lends ethical weight to the practice.
- Cultural Resonance: In some cultures, hunger strikes resonate deeply as a form of protest and sacrifice (Jaina's practice of <u>Santhara</u>). They can evoke sympathy and solidarity from the community and wider society.

### Power Dynamics:

 Challenging Power Dynamics: Hunger strikes can challenge power dynamics by putting pressure on those in authority to address the protester's demands. This can lead to negotiations and potentially peaceful resolutions.

# What are the Arguments Against Hunger Strike?

#### Self-Harm and Preservation of Life:

- **Self-Harm:** Hunger strikes involve **deliberate self-starvation**, which can lead to serious health consequences or even death.
  - From an ethical perspective, deliberately causing harm to oneself can be problematic, especially if there are other non-harmful ways to protest.
- Preservation of Life: Many ethical frameworks, including religious and philosophical

traditions, emphasise the importance of preserving life. A hunger strike, particularly one that leads to severe health deterioration or death, may conflict with these principles.

### Coercion and Manipulation:

- Coercion: Hunger strikes can be seen as a form of coercion, pressuring authorities or the public to meet the protester's demands.
  - This can raise ethical questions about the fairness and legitimacy of one's own demand.
- Manipulation: The hunger strikes may manipulate public sentiment and decisionmaking processes by exploiting empathy and moral guilt, which might not always lead to rational or just outcomes.

### Impact on Others:

- **Emotional Burden:** Hunger strikes can place a **significant emotional burden on family, friends, and supporters** who may suffer from stress, anxiety, and guilt.
  - This raises ethical concerns about the **broader impact of the protest** on innocent parties.
- Responsibility: The responsibility for the striker's well-being may fall on others who
  might be obliged to intervene to save the individual's life, potentially conflicting with the
  striker's autonomy.

#### • Effectiveness:

- Questionable Effectiveness: There is no guarantee that a hunger strike will achieve its intended goals. Ethical concerns can also be raised about the proportionality and rationality of the protest.
- Moral Outcomes: Even if successful, the outcomes of hunger strikes might not always be morally justifiable.

# Exploitation and Vulnerability:

- Exploitation: Vulnerable individuals, including prisoners or marginalised groups, might be coerced or manipulated into participating in hunger strikes by more powerful actors, raising concerns about exploitation and informed consent.
  - It could be seen as an ethically problematic situation of desperation rather than a genuine choice.

## Legal and Medical Ethics:

- Legal Obligations: Authorities may face legal and ethical dilemmas regarding their duty of care.
  - For instance, forcibly feeding a hunger striker can be seen as a violation of their autonomy, but not intervening can be seen as neglect.
- Medical Ethics: Healthcare professionals may face conflicts between respecting patient autonomy and their duty to preserve life.
  - The ethical principle of "do no harm" can be challenged by the self-inflicted harm of a hunger striker.

# What are the Other Dimensions of Hunger Strike?

## Significant Views on Hunger Strikes:

- Mahatma Gandhi: Preferred the **term 'fasting'** and used it as a form of non-violent protest.
  - Fasts aimed at reforming those in power and appealing to their conscience.
  - Believed fasting should be used against a "lover" (someone one loves) to reform rather than extort rights.
- <u>Dr. B.R. Ambedkar</u>: Criticised hunger strikes as "unconstitutional methods."
  - Advocated for constructive approaches within the legal framework to achieve social and economic objectives.

### Legal Framework for Hunger Strikes:

- Geneva Convention: The Geneva Conventions set standards for treating wounded combatants, but their application to hunger strikers is unclear.
  - Hunger strikes as a form of protest can be seen as an extension of combat, complicating the role of health professionals.
- Indian Context: The Madras High Court had ruled that sitting on a hunger strike cannot attract the offence under <u>Section 309 of the IPC</u> (attempt to suicide) and it would not

constitute an attempt to commit suicide.

 However as per <u>Section 224 of BNS</u> anyone who tries to commit suicide to force or stop a public servant from doing their job can be punished with up to one year in jail, a fine, both, or community service.

# **Way Forward**

- Clear and Specific Demands: To justify the extreme measure of a hunger strike, the demands
  must be clearly articulated, specific, and achievable. This ensures that the protest is not
  merely a symbolic gesture but a targeted action with the potential for resolution.
- Independent Mediation: A neutral third-party mediator should be involved from the
  outset. Their role would be to facilitate dialogue between the hunger striker and the
  relevant authorities, aiming to find a resolution without compromising the protester's health or
  safety.
  - An independent ethical review board should assess the proportionality of the hunger strike.
- Healthcare Ethics Guidelines: Clear guidelines should be established for medical professionals treating hunger strikers.
  - These guidelines should balance the duty to preserve life with respect for patient autonomy. They should also address issues such as involuntary feeding, which raises complex ethical questions.
- Public Awareness and Education: Society should be educated about the ethical implications of hunger strikes. This includes understanding the potential consequences for the individual, the impact on the community, and the importance of seeking alternative forms of protest.
- Legal Framework: Governments should consider developing specific legal frameworks to regulate hunger strikes. This could include provisions for mediation, ethical review, and the protection of the hunger striker's rights while ensuring public safety.
- Positive Incentives: Rather than solely focusing on the negative consequences of hunger strikes, policies should promote positive incentives for peaceful protest and dialogue. This could include support for mediation services, civil society organizations, and platforms for constructive engagement.

### **Drishti Mains Ouestion:**

Discuss the ethical dilemmas associated with hunger strikes. How should authorities balance these concerns while addressing the grievances of hunger strikers?

# **UPSC Civil Services Examination, Previous Year Question (PYQ)**

# Prelims:

- Q. Under the Indian Constitution, concentration of wealth violates (2021)
- (a) the Right to Equality
- (b) the Directive Principles of State Policy
- (c) the Right to Freedom
- (d) the Concept of Welfare

Ans: (b)

- Q. Which one of the following categories of Fundamental Rights incorporates protection against untouchability as a form of discrimination? (2020)
- (a) Right against Exploitation

- (b) Right to Freedom
- (c) Right to Constitutional Remedies
- (d) Right to Equality

Ans: (d)

# Mains:

**Q.** Analyse the distinguishing features of the notion of Right to Equality in the Constitutions of the USA and India. **(2021)** 

