



Mains Practice Question

Case Studies

As the municipal commissioner of a significant city, renowned for your integrity and steadfast adherence to the law, you find yourself confronted with a serious situation following a tragic incident at a construction site. A multipurpose mall project, employing numerous daily wage laborers, experienced a devastating roof collapse during a monsoon night, resulting in the loss of lives of four workers, including two minors, and leaving many others critically injured. This catastrophic event has stirred public outcry, prompting the government to initiate an inquiry.

Upon preliminary investigation, a troubling pattern of irregularities has surfaced. It has been revealed that substandard materials were utilized in the construction, and the building deviated from the approved plans by including an unauthorized additional basement. Despite periodic inspections by municipal building inspectors, these discrepancies went undetected. Furthermore, the construction encroached upon designated green belt and slip road areas outlined in the city's Zonal Master Plan.

Complicating matters, your predecessor, a senior colleague, and an acquaintance approved the mall's construction, raising questions about potential collusion between municipal officials and the builders. Also, pressure from within the municipal corporation to temper the inquiry has emerged, with colleagues urging you to proceed cautiously. Additionally, the builder, who wields considerable wealth and influence, is a close relative of a powerful state cabinet minister. He has attempted to influence the investigation in his favor by offering financial incentives and implying potential legal repercussions under the Prevention of Sexual Harassment (POSH) Act if matters are not resolved to his advantage swiftly.

- (a) Discuss the ethical issues involved in the case.
- (b) What are the options available to you in this situation?
- (c) Explain your selected course of action.

01 Mar, 2024 GS Paper 4 Case Studies

Approach

- Start the answer with a discussion that sets a context for the question.
- Discuss the ethical issues involved in this case.
- Discuss the options available to address the situation.
- Explain your selected course of action.
- Conclude suitably.

Introduction

- The case study involves the collapse of a mall construction resulting in the death of laborers, corruption, negligence, and influence peddling. As a municipal commissioner committed to upholding the law and ensuring public safety, there is an ethical responsibility to prioritize the welfare of citizens over personal relationships or pressures.

Body

(a) The ethical issues involved in this case:

- **Collusion and Corruption:** The discovery of substandard materials, deviations from approved plans, and potential collusion between municipal officials and builders raise significant ethical concerns regarding corruption, accountability, and trust in governance.
- **Justice and Fairness:** The tragic loss of four workers' lives, two of whom were minors, highlights the exploitation faced by daily wage laborers. It is crucial to ensure justice for the victims and uphold fairness in the investigation, even in the face of pressure from influential individuals or entities.
- **Conflict of Interest:** The participation of a senior colleague and acquaintance in approving the construction, which encroached upon a designated green belt, raises concerns regarding conflicts of interest and impartiality in decision-making processes.
- **Transparency and Accountability:** The failure of the building inspector and other officials to notice and address the violations shows negligence in their duties.
 - Ethical leadership requires transparency in addressing the situation and holding accountable those responsible for negligence or wrongdoing, regardless of their status or connections.

(b) Some of the options available to address the situation include:

Option 1: Commence a thorough investigation with a strict policy of zero tolerance towards corruption which includes :

- **Initiating a Thorough Investigation:** Launch a comprehensive investigation into the construction project, working closely with relevant authorities, experts, and independent bodies to uncover the truth and identify those responsible.
- **Strict Disciplinary Measures:** Enforce strict disciplinary measures against employees found guilty of corruption or collusion.
- **Strengthen Oversight and Accountability:** Implement measures to strengthen oversight and accountability within the municipal corporation, including enhanced inspections and strict enforcement of regulations to prevent corruption.

Option 2: Downplay the incident and minimize the loss which includes :

- **Cover-up:** Conceal evidence to downplay the severity of the incident or deflect blame away from responsible parties, to protect the reputation of the municipal corporation or influential individuals involved.
- **Emergency Medical Assistance:** Deploy medical teams to provide immediate medical assistance to the injured victims, ensuring they receive prompt treatment and care.
- **Arrange Financial Assistance:** Arrange immediate financial assistance or compensation to the victims and their families to help cover immediate expenses and support their recovery process

Option 3: Allowing the legal processes to unfold naturally and focus on implementing structural reforms which include:

- **Allowing the Legal Process to Unfold Naturally:** Delegate the case to the police authorities, entrusting them with the responsibility to conduct a thorough investigation and allow the legal process to unfold naturally.
- **Establish Transparent Processes:** Establish transparent processes and procedures for all aspects of municipal operations, including procurement, contracting, and licensing. This transparency helps to deter corrupt practices by making it easier to detect and report irregularities.
- **Technology Solutions:** Invest in technology solutions, such as e-procurement systems and digital record-keeping platforms, to reduce opportunities for corruption and improve the efficiency and transparency of municipal operations.
- **Foster Public Trust:** Communicate openly and transparently with the public about the investigation findings, actions taken, and steps being implemented to prevent similar incidents in

the future, fostering public trust and accountability in governance.

(c) The selected course of action will entail integrating aspects from various available options sequentially as mentioned below:

- **Emergency Medical Assistance:** Deploy medical teams to provide immediate medical assistance to the injured victims, ensuring they receive prompt treatment and care.
- **Initiating a Thorough Investigation:** Launch a comprehensive investigation into the construction project, working closely with relevant authorities, experts, and independent bodies to uncover the truth and identify those responsible.
- **Arrange Financial Assistance:** Arrange immediate financial assistance or compensation to the victims and their families to help cover immediate expenses and support their recovery process.
- **Enforce Strict Disciplinary Measures:** Enforce strict disciplinary measures against employees found guilty of corruption or collusion.
- **Establish Transparent Processes:** Establish transparent processes and procedures for all aspects of municipal operations, including procurement, contracting, and licensing.
- **Strengthen Oversight and Accountability:** Implement measures to strengthen oversight and accountability within the municipal corporation, including enhanced inspections and strict enforcement of regulations to prevent corruption.
- **Technology Solutions:** Invest in technology solutions, such as e-procurement systems and digital record-keeping platforms, to reduce opportunities for corruption and improve the efficiency and transparency of municipal operations.
- **Foster Public Trust:** Communicate openly and transparently with the public about the investigation findings, actions taken, and steps being implemented to prevent similar incidents in the future, fostering public trust and accountability in governance.

Conclusion

Demonstrating zero tolerance for corruption within the municipal corporation not only addresses past instances of misconduct and collusion but also serves to prevent future occurrences. It is not just a moral imperative but also a practical necessity for the functioning and success of democratic governance.

PDF Reference URL: <https://www.drishtiias.com/mains-practice-question/question-8185/pnt>